Our Vision
To be one of the leading
Supreme Audit Institutions
in the world, delivering
professional, excellent, and
cost effective auditing
services by the year 2010

PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT
of the
AUDITOR-GENERAL
on the
MANAGEMENT OF
FOREIGN SCHOLARSHIPS
EDWARD DUA AGYEMAN
AUDITOR-GENERAL
# Report of the Auditor-General on the Management of Foreign Scholarships

## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transmittal Letter</td>
<td>i - ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Summary</td>
<td>iii - vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Reasons for the audit</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Purpose and scope</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Method and implementation</td>
<td>2 – 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. DESCRIPTIVE CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Historical background</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Goals and objectives</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Funding</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Current development</td>
<td>6 – 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Key players and main activities</td>
<td>7 – 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. FINDINGS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Awards Elapse</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Beneficiaries of awards do not return</td>
<td>15 – 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Inadequate and delayed funding</td>
<td>16 – 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Ineffective monitoring of beneficiaries</td>
<td>20 – 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Ineffective bonding</td>
<td>21 – 23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Weak incentives for beneficiaries</td>
<td>23 – 24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. **SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS**

- Recommendations 30
- Making maximum use of the awards
- Ensuring that beneficiaries return home 31 – 32
- Adequate funding 31 – 32
- Improved monitoring of beneficiaries 32
- Effective bonding 33
- Improved incentives for beneficiaries 33 – 34

5. **APPENDICES**

- "A" - List of institutions visited
- "B" - Scholarships Secretariat
- "C" - List of abbreviations
- "D" - List of documents
Ref. No. AG.01/109

Office of the
Auditor-General
Ministries Block 'O'
P. O. Box MB 96
Accra

Tel. (021) 662493
Fax (021) 662493

30th June 2006

Dear Sir,

PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL
ON THE MANAGEMENT OF FOREIGN SCHOLARSHIPS

I have the honour to submit to you for presentation to Parliament my 11th performance audit report in pursuant to Article 187(5) of the 1992 Constitution and Section 13(e) of the Audit Service Act, Act 584. The Audit Service Act which came into force in November 2000, gives me authority to audit programmes and activities of public offices to ensure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of resources.

2. The Audit Service traditionally audits the financial statements prepared by public bodies. Performance auditing has been introduced at Ghana Audit Service as part of a capacity building project funded by the European Union. The team that carried out the audit comprised Messrs G. Akorly (Leader), S. A. K. Quist and S. K. Salifu under the supervision of Messrs. Yaw Sifah, Director and R. K. Anaglate, Deputy Auditor-General, all of Performance Audits Department.

3. Performance audits are carried out by teams of professional staff, including specialists such as architects, legal experts, engineers,
economists and accountants. Depending on the extent of the coverage and complexity, it normally takes between six months and one year to complete a performance audit, thus, making it more expensive than the traditional financial audit. Effective performance audits can lead to better use of resources by public bodies and provide support to democratic governments by bringing about accountability and transparency, improved operations and better decision-making.

4. This report to Parliament is the 11th report prepared by staff who have been professionally trained in conducting Performance Audits to internationally recognised standards to supplement the financial audits.

5. I would like to thank my staff for their assistance in the preparation of this report and the staff of the Scholarships Secretariat, Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, Ministry of Health and other institutions for assistance offered to my staff during the audit.

6. I trust that this performance audit report will meet the approval of Parliament.

Yours Sincerely,

EDWARD DUA AGYEMAN
AUDITOR-GENERAL

THE RT. HON. SPEAKER
OFFICE OF PARLIAMENT
PARLIAMENT HOUSE
ACCRA
PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT OF THE
AUDITOR-GENERAL ON THE MANAGEMENT OF
FOREIGN SCHOLARSHIPS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Foreign scholarships are awards offered by the Government of Ghana and Foreign Governments to Ghanaian students to study abroad to improve the country’s manpower requirements.

2. The purpose of the audit was to find out whether these foreign scholarships are being effectively utilised.

3. The audit was based on interviews, review of documents, and survey. It covered the period 2001 to 2003. The team visited Ashanti and Northern Regions. In Greater Accra Region, the views of five major awarding institutions; Scholarships Secrétariat, Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MoFEP), Ministry of Health (MoH), Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Japanese International Cooperation Agency (JICA) were sought in the award of scholarships.

4. The audit revealed that the objectives of the awarding institutions and foreign governments were not being fully achieved.

5. The report details the findings under:
   ✦ awards elapse;
   ✦ beneficiaries of the awards do not return;
   ✦ inadequate and delayed funding;

Report of the Auditor-General on Management of Foreign Scholarships
ineffective monitoring of beneficiaries;
ineffective bonding; and
weak incentives for beneficiaries.

**Awards elapse**

6. Notices of awards to beneficiaries arrive very late and since they cannot be processed in time to meet the deadline for submission, some scholarships elapse. To enable the country make use of all the awards available, we recommend the following:

(i) MoFEP and MoH should advertise all awards in the major local newspapers as done by Scholarships Secretariat;

(ii) Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH should ensure that notification of awards to tertiary institutions, MDAs and other beneficiary organisations are sent early;

(iii) Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH must ensure that notifications are circulated to staff of organisations as widely as possible and a time limit is set for the submission of application forms; and

(iv) Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH should introduce the use of the internet for the speedy processing of awards.
Beneficiaries do not return

7. The audit found that not all beneficiaries of awards do return home. We recommend that Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP liaise with the countries that offer the scholarships to adopt the policy of tight monitoring of students that pertains in Eastern Europe to ensure that beneficiaries return home after their courses. In addition, Ghana’s Missions abroad should be made to closely monitor the activities of the beneficiaries to ensure that they return to Ghana on completion of their courses.

Inadequate funding

8. The audit shows that GoG funding of the courses of students abroad is inadequate. This is because the computation of students’ allowances are based on the outdated per diem chart of 1983. In addition, the allowances are unduly delayed. To reduce the hardships suffered by students as a result, we recommend that:

(i) The Chief of Staff, Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP should impress upon the government to review upwards the rates used to compute allowances for students; and

(ii) Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH should ensure that the allowances are sent to the students on time, may be two weeks after the commencement of courses.

Ineffective monitoring of beneficiaries

9. Ghana’s Missions do not monitor the activities of beneficiaries abroad. This is because few beneficiaries register with them and the Missions themselves do not get in touch with the beneficiaries. Secondly, on their return to the country beneficiaries do not report to the awarding authorities, which do not know their whereabouts as a result.
10. To facilitate effective monitoring of beneficiaries we recommend that:

(i) Chief of Staff, Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP should liaise with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to develop robust strategies to monitor the activities of the beneficiaries abroad, for instance by assigning consular officers in our Embassies to monitor students; and

(ii) Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP should on an annual basis send a list of beneficiaries to all Embassies concerned to enable them proactively monitor their activities.

Ineffective bonding

11. Beneficiaries are required to sign bonds with the awarding institutions or with their establishments. The rationale behind it is to get the beneficiaries to either work for the Government of Ghana or go back to their original places of work to contribute to the strengthening and improvement of the functions of those institutions.

12. The audit revealed that beneficiaries do not sign the bond whilst others flout it. The bond was also referred to as “weak” because only one parent was enough to guarantee it. Consequently, defaulters do not pay the bond fees or the penalty.

13. We recommend that:

(i) at least two easily recognisable (notable) citizens should sign the bond form and provide an immovable property to guarantee the bond;
the awarding authorities and MDAs should not hesitate to use the security agencies of the country to enforce the bond when it is flouted; and

(iii) awarding authorities should arrange with foreign institutions where beneficiaries are studying so that upon completion of their courses the universities will send the certificates to the awarding authorities. These will then be released to beneficiaries only after they have worked for the number of years stipulated in the bond.

Weak incentives for beneficiaries

14. We noted that beneficiaries return abroad because of lack of employment and those already in employment leave for private establishments, international organisations and NGOs because of poor remuneration and other working conditions.

We recommend that:

(i) MDAs and other organisations should put in place effective plans to ensure the prompt placement of beneficiaries when they return to the country;

(ii) MDAs and other public sector organisations should be well equipped to enable beneficiaries use the knowledge acquired for the benefit of the country; and

(iii) MDAs should carry out a needs assessment to ensure skills acquired are relevant to the requirements of particular MDAs.
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Reasons for the audit

The government of Ghana after independence in 1957 decided to award scholarships to Ghanaians in a bid to improve the manpower base of the country. Foreign countries and development partners also award scholarships to Ghanaians through their Missions in Ghana. The Scholarships Secretariat was established by the government mainly to administer Government of Ghana awards, whilst the foreign scholarships are mostly handled by Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MoFEP).

2. The general public have raised concerns about the mode of awarding and effectiveness of these scholarships. Some of these concerns are as follows:

- beneficiaries are not made aware of the scholarships;
- beneficiaries are trained abroad in certain skills yet these skills are still lacking in the country;
- some beneficiaries do not return to the country after their studies abroad; and
- some beneficiaries go back after returning to the country.
3. It is because of these concerns that we conducted a performance audit into the awards of foreign scholarships in the country, to determine the extent of the problems and offer suggestions for improvement.

**Purpose and scope**

4. The purpose of the audit was to examine the effectiveness of the awards of scholarships to citizens of Ghana for studies abroad. We examined procedures for awarding, processing and monitoring of the awards.

5. The study covered three financial years: 2001, 2002 and 2003. We visited three regions: Greater Accra, Ashanti, and Northern. At the central level, we interacted with five major awarding institutions to obtain their views on the award of scholarships. In the regions, we visited Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) and interviewed directors, desk officers and beneficiaries. The institutions are:

- Scholarships Secretariat;
- Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning;
- Ministry of Health;
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs; and
- Japanese International Cooperation Agency (JICA).

**Methods and implementation**

6. We adopted the following methods:
Review of documents
7. We reviewed documents received from the awarding institutions visited (listed as Appendix “A”). The objective was to know about the awards as regards the eligibility, funding, bonding and processing.

Interviews
8. We conducted interviews in the three regions. We interviewed the heads of departments, desk officers and beneficiaries to know about the difficulties involved in the processing and effectiveness of the awards.

Survey
9. We collected data on the number of staff in organisations who have benefited from these scholarships and the number who have returned for a five-year period (1999-2003). To have an idea of the return rate, we reviewed a survey initiated by Scholarships Secretariat from 1999 to 2003. We also conducted a survey of eleven institutions (1999-2003) to buttress the results of the previous survey.
Structure of the audit report

10. Chapter 1 introduces the report while Chapter 2 gives a detailed description of the process of awarding scholarships by the various awarding institutions to citizens of Ghana in terms of goals and objectives, funding, bonding, monitoring, key players and main activities. Chapter 3 deals with the findings of the audit. Chapter 4 presents the summary and conclusions. In Chapter 5, the report made recommendations to the Chief of Staff, Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, Scholarships Secretariat, the Ministry of Health and MDAs in order to improve the efficiency and effectiveness in the award of foreign scholarships.
CHAPTER TWO

DESCRIPTIVE CHAPTER

2.1 Historical background

11. Scholarships Secretariat's awards of foreign scholarships came into being after independence when the Government of Ghana realised the need to train its citizens to provide manpower needs. As a result, Ghanaians were sent abroad by the Government of Ghana to train, especially, in areas for which such courses were not available in the country. Foreign countries offered assistance in the form of scholarships to the citizens of the country to train in those areas to complement Ghana's efforts at developing her manpower requirements.

12. There are five main awarding institutions which administer scholarship awards for under-graduate, post-graduate and short courses, as shown in Table 1:

Table 1: Scholarships awarding institutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Awarding Institutions</th>
<th>Awards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scholarships Secretariat</td>
<td>Commonwealth, GoG, GETFUND</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning</td>
<td>Commonwealth, Grants, Other Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
<td>GoG, MoH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>Embassies in Ghana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA</td>
<td>Japan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our study is limited to these institutions.
2.2 **Goals and objectives**

13. The goal of Scholarships Secretariat is to utilize government and donor funds for the provision of scholarships to beneficiaries and workers in support of the country's human resource development.

14. Targeted participants of the JICA and other donor programmes are key persons in their establishments. They go overseas to acquire knowledge and technology in a wide range of fields. When they return to Ghana they are expected to strengthen and improve the functions of the institutions for sustainable development. They are expected to put to use the knowledge and technology they have acquired.

15. The overall aim of donor countries is to alleviate qualitative and quantitative shortages of skilled manpower. This is to be done within the framework of sustainable capacity building. The target group, thus, consists of mostly mid-career professionals who are already in gainful employment. The training must help the organisations to develop.

2.3 **Funding**

16. The main source of funding for Scholarships Secretariat is the Government of Ghana. Scholarships Secretariat spent ₦40.9 billion on awards and top-ups for the three years under review: 2001, 2002 and 2003 as shown by Table 2:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>First Quarter</th>
<th>Second Quarter</th>
<th>Third Quarter</th>
<th>Fourth Quarter</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>811,541,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>811,541,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,750,695,225.00</td>
<td>1,966,262,899.12</td>
<td>9,857,427,094.55</td>
<td>13,574,385,218.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2,491,289,805.00</td>
<td>4,200,000,000.00</td>
<td>19,866,912,316.00</td>
<td>26,558,202,121.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>811,541,000.00</td>
<td>811,541,000.00</td>
<td>40.9 billion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Scholarships Secretariat

*Report of the Auditor-General on Management of Foreign Scholarships*
17. We could not ascertain the amount of money spent by donors and foreign governments on Ghanaian beneficiaries because they do not provide such information to the awarding institutions. Government of Ghana tops up its awards during the financial year.

2.4 Current development

18. Previously, applicants for the Netherlands award should not be more than 40 years old. This was waived in 2004 after the President's visit to the Netherlands. PhD programmes have been added to the Netherlands awards, which is the most active of all the awards administered by MoFEP. About four years ago, the awards, which were hitherto strictly confined to the public service, were extended to the private sector. Another significant development is the use of Ghana Education Trust Fund (GETFUND) by the government to fund foreign awards.

2.5 Key players and main activities

Scholarships Secretariat

19. The main function of Scholarships Secretariat is to administer and exercise central control over scholarship awards for manpower development so as to ensure an effective and strong manpower support for the various national development programmes.

20. Among other things, the Secretariat is responsible for the administration of the following scholarship awards:

- Ghana Government awards tenable overseas;
Scholarships offered to Ghana by Foreign Governments/Organisations and International Organisations; and
GETFUND postgraduate scholarship awards.

Donor Awards

Procedure of the awards

21. Scholarships Secretariat advertises the awards in the newspapers inviting applicants to apply to the Secretariat for forms. The forms are sent to applicants between July and August every year and interested parties mail or send these forms to the Secretariat after completing them. The applicants are short-listed according to merit. Selection is based on grades and age. Short-listed applicants are invited for an interview and the successful candidates are given other forms to fill. They are eventually processed and sent to the donors' countries (Canada, New Zealand, etc.) to make their selection. The countries select their candidates and Scholarships Secretariat is informed. Finally, the Secretariat writes to the selected applicants.

Government of Ghana

22. Government gives these awards to Ghanaian lecturers in tertiary institutions for staff development e.g. Universities/Centre for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR). These institutions look for foreign universities for their staff. Members of staff are also encouraged to seek and obtain admission to recognised foreign institutions. Scholarships Secretariat writes to the public tertiary institutions in Ghana in March, to nominate their candidates. The Secretariat makes sure they have obtained admission and the university's tuition fees and other charges are moderate.

Report of the Auditor-General on Management of Foreign Scholarships
GETFUND

23. The GETFUND award is offered to academic and non-academic personnel of Ghana’s Universities, Teaching Hospitals, Polytechnics and other Tertiary Institutions to pursue postgraduate and doctorate degree courses overseas.

Procedure for the awards

Eligibility

24. Candidates should satisfy the following requirements:
   a. be Ghanaian citizens;
   b. be not more than 45 years of age; and
   c. should be sponsored by any of the Government Universities, Medical Schools, Polytechnics, Ghana Health Service or any of the Government Tertiary Institutions.

Subject area

   a. Health, Medical, Pharmacy, Dentistry;
   b. Agricultural and Agro-based Studies; and
   c. Social Science, Economics, Tourism, Business Administration, Actuarial Science, etc.

25. Interested candidates must have proof that they have obtained firm confirmation of admission to a recognised university overseas. The Vice-Chancellor, Pro Vice-Chancellor, Dean, Provost or Principal of the considered academic (tertiary) institution signs the applicant’s recommendation letter. Candidates who require assistance for short
academic courses are also considered. Only Tuition Fees within the range of £7,000 to £14,000 per semester is considered.

**Japanese International Cooperation Agency**

26. Training programme for overseas participants is one of JICA's main activities, involving technical cooperation for developing countries. This programme is designed to support JICA's overall activities from the aspect of human resource development. It is mostly implemented in coordination with JICA's other programmes. Currently, JICA is accepting participants from over 150 countries.

27. There are two types of training programmes in Japan: group training and individual training. JICA formulates the curriculum of group training courses according to the common needs of the developing countries. In each course, one participant is sent from each country, and about ten participants take part. The training need differs according to the country and the area involved. JICA, therefore, conducts country-focused training programmes, which offer training tailored to a specific country or area's development plan. The curriculum of individual training programmes is formulated on the request of the nominating country. Courses are also conducted in response to requests from international organisations.

28. In recent years, the needs for training courses are becoming extremely diversified due to the differences in economic, social, environmental and other conditions in developing countries. Under such circumstances, JICA performs either surveys abroad or assessment of the existing courses in the related organs in Japan. JICA then plans the training
courses annually for each need, making full use of the information gained from these surveys.

29. JICA sends a list of training courses to each nominating country. This list is referred to as General Information (GI). The GI describes in detail the contents of each course, number of participants, their qualifications, rules and regulations, the training period, the curriculum and other information.

Procedure for awards
30. By July every year, JICA writes to MoFEP through the Japanese Embassy. They give Ghana a quota of 75 places. Ghana selects nominees for the courses according to the conditions stated in the GI. The country then sends a nomination form (A2-3) to JICA, which includes information such as the background of the request, the content of the proposed training courses, the personal history of the nominated participants, their English proficiency and medical certificate.

31. After a close examination of the nomination or application, JICA makes a decision on whether to accept the participants, and then informs the country of the results of the selection.

Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
32. Although Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning administers awards received from Ministry of Foreign Affairs and also directly from Foreign Missions in Ghana, the Netherlands award is the most active.
Netherlands Fellowship Programmes (NFP)

33. The Netherlands Fellowship Programmes are demand-oriented fellowship programmes designed to foster institutional development. The NFP is funded by the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs from the budget for development cooperation. The overall aim of the NFP is to alleviate qualitative and quantitative shortages of skilled manpower and to do so within the framework of sustainable capacity building directed towards reducing poverty in developing countries.

34. More specifically, the NFP is focused on meeting the need for further training and capacity building in developing countries. To maximise the fellowship’s impact on capacity building, NFP-funded training must be linked to the institutional development of organisations. A wide range of organisations are eligible — governmental, private and non-governmental. They include educational institutions, planning agencies, ministries, community-based organisations, and private enterprises.

35. The NFP target group consists of mid-career professionals who are already in employment and who are nationals of 57 selected countries. While fellowships are awarded to individuals, the need for training must occur within the context of the local organisation for which an applicant works. The training must help the organisation to develop. This means that their employers must nominate the applicants. An applicant without the support of an employer will not be considered.

36. For professionals from organisations in developing countries, the NFP offers the following options:
   - tailor-made training;
   - fellowships for PhD;
refresher courses;

fellowships for short courses; and

fellowships for master’s degree programmes

37. For the PhD studies, short courses and master’s degree programmes, NFP uses a two-step application procedure. Applicants must first gain admission to the course or programme they have chosen, and only then can they apply for a fellowship through Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning. To gain admission to a course or programme, an applicant has to contact the relevant institution directly.

**Ministry of Health**  
**(Fellowship Management)**

38. The MoH has established a Fellowships Award Committee to be in charge of training and to address basic problems involved in the award of scholarships. Hitherto there was a lack of systematic process for fellowships allocation. Fellowships were based on individual efforts and not MoH priorities. Fellows/ Beneficiaries seemed not to be bound by any significant rules, bonds, or instructions. Regions and immediate supervisors and managers did not have much say in the determination of fellowship awards. Lastly, no clear criteria existed for the awards for training.

39. Fellowships and sponsorships cover both external and local training and are usually for post-graduate and post-basic training courses. However, external training is much more expensive, has foreign exchange implications and because of higher demand for training, it is a lot more competitive. This creates issues of equity between regions and between various professional categories. For the Fellowships Award Committee
(FAC) to be effective, it must advise on both local and foreign training, apportioning and distributing these according to the Ministry's needs and priorities as well as taking account of available resources. The recommendation of FAC for awards is subject to the approval of the Minister of Health in consultation with the DMS.

Sources of Sponsorship/Funding

40. The following are the sources of funding:

- Government of Ghana -MoH Training Budget;
- External Donor - Project Specific support;
- External Donor –Non-Project Specific support;
- Partial External Donor sponsorship (e.g. requiring GoG Airfare or other support);
- Self Sponsorship (often partial, covers shipping/book allowance, etc.);
- All beneficiaries of the awards are to serve a bond not exceeding five years; and
- More details about the awarding institutions can be found in Appendix "B".
CHAPTER THREE

FINDINGS

3.0 Introduction

41. The overall aim of the awards is to alleviate qualitative and quantitative shortages of skilled manpower and to do so within the framework of sustainable capacity building and development. Participants go overseas to acquire knowledge and technology in a wide range of fields. Upon return to Ghana, they are expected to put to use the knowledge and technology they have acquired. The audit revealed, however, that the awards are not being used effectively because awards elapse, beneficiaries do not return, beneficiaries go back abroad or join other organisations in the country.

3.1 Awards elapse

42. Although Scholarships Secretariat advertises the award of foreign scholarships in the newspapers ("Daily Graphic" and "Ghanaian Times"), MoFEP does not. According to a senior official of the Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP is unable to utilise two-thirds of the awards that go to it. Besides advertising scholarships, Scholarships Secretariat, in respect of the GETFUND and Government of Ghana Awards, sends letters to deserving institutions to present nominations. MoFEP sends brochures (Netherlands award) to the various MDAs and tertiary institutions. The other awards from the embassies that are received by Scholarships Secretariat and MoH are communicated to the heads of departments and they decide on the mode of dissemination.
43. Few staff get to know of the existence of the brochures, thus, most of them miss the opportunity to apply for the available scholarships. This is because:

- the brochures are not widely circulated;
- circulars informing staff of the awards are sent late; and
- staff do not know the criteria for the awards.

44. Moreover, successful applicants are sometimes notified late (at times a day or two before departure). Consequently, beneficiaries go through pre-departure formalities (e.g. visa, medical exam, approval for study leave, bonding) with difficulty. Some beneficiaries lost their jobs because they could not wait for the approval of study leave. Other beneficiaries who were not able to process their documents in time because of the short notice (especially staff in the northern regions), lost the awards. Some beneficiaries left for their foreign institutions when lectures had already started.

3.2 Beneficiaries do not return

45. Our audit also revealed that a number of beneficiaries do not return to the country after their courses, thus, defeating the purpose of the awards. This means that the country is losing part of its important and strategic manpower.

46. According to a senior official at Scholarships Secretariat, there are more than 500 beneficiaries who have remained in the US after completing their courses in 2002 and 2003. In 2003, 12 beneficiaries who graduated in Cuba failed to return, whilst in 2002, six of them refused to return home.
An analysis provided by Professor S. Y. Mensah of the Department of Physics in the University of Cape Coast (in 2004) on awards administered by Scholarships Secretariat (Table 3) indicated that from 1999 to 2003 out of 166 beneficiaries who left Ghana, only 19 had returned. Thirty-two were assumed to have completed (the Secretariat has no knowledge of their whereabouts) because they should have been back in the country at the time of the survey. Eighty-eight beneficiaries under the "no remark" column were assumed not returned. The result of the analysis has also been presented graphically as Figure 1:

**Figure 1** Sponsored beneficiaries (1999-2003)

![Pie chart showing the distribution of beneficiaries]

Source: GAS
Table 3: Sponsored beneficiaries (1999 – 2003)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>No. Sponsored</th>
<th>No. Returned</th>
<th>Assumed Completed</th>
<th>Extension</th>
<th>Withdrawn</th>
<th>Dead</th>
<th>No Remark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medical Science</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological Science</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Music, Theatre, Art &amp; Design</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Science</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agric &amp; Food Technical</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer &amp; Inf Tech</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Science</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maths/Statistics</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Resource</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adm &amp; Bus, Studs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Int. Diploma Macy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range Science</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nematology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cartography</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audiology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Scholarships Secretariat

48. Our survey involving eleven institutions revealed that out of 57 beneficiaries who were supposed to have returned, only 33 of them were at post. Nineteen beneficiaries failed to return and five resigned shortly after they had returned. Thus, 24 or 42.1% of beneficiaries were lost. (See Table 4)

Table 4: GAS survey of 11 beneficiary institutions (1999 – 2003)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Supposed to have returned</th>
<th>Resigned/Absconded upon return</th>
<th>At post</th>
<th>Failed to return</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KNUST</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SARI</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-POLY</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GES,TAMALE</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K-POLY</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOIL RES INST,KSI</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUILD &amp; RD RES INST</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OIL PALM RESEARCH</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WATER RESEARCH</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FORESTRY RESEARCH</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: GAS computation
49. In 2004, Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology (KNUST) looking at trends in study leave returns over a ten year period, recorded that out of 437 lecturers who were screened, 320 had returned, those who were still studying were 98 and those who had absconded were 19, resulting in 4.3% absconding. Ten out of the 19 beneficiaries (56.6%) absconded between the period 1999-2003. This condition of absconding beneficiaries is a big loss to the state considering the fact that it costs about $15,000 to train a Ghanaian student overseas.

50. Interviews conducted in the three regions also confirmed that whilst some staff were comfortable at their original places of work, others had left to join NGOs, international and other local organisations as a result of low salaries and lack of job satisfaction which is partly due to unsatisfactory working tools.
3.3 Inadequate and delayed funding

51. JICA, Scholarships Secretariat (GoG and GETFUND) and a few donors fund the awards fully. Other countries provide only partial funding. This has necessitated “top ups” by GoG.

52. Funding provided by GoG is insufficient. According to some beneficiaries we spoke to, the worst insufficient scholarship is GoG scholarships. This is due to the inadequacy of funding by the Government of Ghana. The amount is meagre because GoG figures are based on 1983 (per diem) computations, which still apply now. Table 5 shows the difference between the two main sources of funding of foreign scholarships by the government of Ghana.

Table: 5 Difference between GoG Funding and GETFUND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Allowance</th>
<th>GET FUND</th>
<th>GoG</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Monthly Maintenance</td>
<td>£600.00</td>
<td>£500.00</td>
<td>£1,200.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Warm Clothing</td>
<td>$275.00</td>
<td>$275.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Book</td>
<td>£350.00</td>
<td>£350/£200 for subsequent years</td>
<td>£300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Thesis</td>
<td>£400.00</td>
<td>£400.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Winding-up</td>
<td>£900.00</td>
<td>£750.00</td>
<td>£150.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Shipping</td>
<td>3 shipping tons</td>
<td>3 shipping tons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difference (A+CX3+E)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>£4,650.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Scholarships Secretariat

Using the data in the table, the difference between GETFUND and GoG funding for a three year course amounts to £4,650 or €69.75 million Cedis.

53. In addition, the amounts sent to the beneficiaries pursuing their studies abroad are unduly delayed. From the staff we interviewed, it takes between four to eight months for beneficiaries to receive their moneys abroad. Consequently, some beneficiaries have to live with friends because they cannot pay their rent; others are compelled to work to pay their school fees and rent, whilst others cannot take their examination because of unpaid

*Report of the Auditor-General on Management of Foreign Scholarships*
school fees. Besides, some beneficiaries face further hardship because they are not aware they are entitled to top-ups from GoG. In addition, they face the problem of buying their own tickets for which they are reimbursed later.

54. The Shipment allowance (not more than three shipping tons) of beneficiaries should be paid to them two months before they return home. However, payment is also delayed. It takes a minimum of four months, when the applicant has arrived in the country, before the allowance is paid. One interviewee had his allowance paid after three years. To make matters worse, the amount is converted into cedis and paid at the exchange rate prevailing at the time of the application. Other beneficiaries were so disillusioned that they did not bother to apply for their shipment allowance because they felt they would not get it.

55. According to a senior official at the Scholarships Secretariat, in 1999 and 2002 Ghanaian beneficiaries offering a year’s course in French in Burkina Faso, Dakar and Cotonou respectively, revolted over delayed allowances.

Ineffective monitoring of beneficiaries

56. Section 3 of the rules governing the award of foreign scholarships, states that all beneficiaries must be under the charge, direction and control of Ghana Missions abroad. Indeed all Ghanaians, including the beneficiaries, are enjoined by legislation to report to the country’s Missions. The Scholarships Secretariat has only one official outside Ghana, the Minister Councillor of Education, who resides in the UK, taking care of the welfare of beneficiaries.
57. However, very few beneficiaries report their arrival in the country of study to the respective Ghana Embassies. According to an interviewee, this is because they do not have the money to visit the Missions. Scholarships Secretariat sends a list of the beneficiaries to the Missions but they do not trace beneficiaries. Consequently, they cannot monitor the activities of the beneficiaries in question.

58. A number of probable effects of the lack of monitoring of beneficiaries are the following:

❖ beneficiaries do not report their progress at the end of every term by submitting an attestation of a satisfactory progress report from the Dean of the Faculty or Supervisor;
❖ beneficiaries fail to reside in an approved college, hostel or lodgings;
❖ beneficiaries do not devote their time to following the course for which the scholarship is awarded;
❖ they engage in activities which are considered detrimental to their progress in their prescribed course of study;
❖ beneficiaries change their courses without the prior approval of the scholarship awarding authorities;
❖ beneficiaries do not take their examinations; and
❖ beneficiaries fail their examinations.

59. The overall effect is that the beneficiaries feel they have been left to fend for themselves in a foreign land. They feel neglected and eventually their sense of patriotism diminishes, and it is not likely they will come back.

60. Beneficiaries are to present reports to the awarding organisations (Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP, MoH and JICA) between one to two
weeks after their arrival in the country. This, amongst others, is to serve as evidence of the arrival of the beneficiaries back in the country after their studies. However, a very high number of beneficiaries do not comply with this requirement. Our interaction with Scholarships Secretariat revealed that from 1999 to 2003, out of 166 beneficiaries who should have returned, only 19 returned. They are the only ones who had presented their reports. Thirty-two of them were presumed to have returned because according to the records, they should have completed their studies by then. Eighty-eight did not return (Table 2). It shows that the Secretariat cannot adequately monitor the arrival of beneficiaries back to the country and subsequently, does not know the whereabouts of almost 72% of the awardees.

61. According to the desk officer at the JICA Office (not at MoFEP), beneficiaries report one week after their return and present an action plan of what they want to do with the knowledge acquired. After six months to a year, JICA follows up to monitor the project and assess its impact. According to the official, every student who enjoys the award returns.

3.5 Ineffective bonding

62. The Scholarships Secretariat enjoins beneficiaries to return to Ghana to rejoin or to enter service in the civil establishment or armed forces of Ghana, if called upon to do so for a period of five years or to undertake any service in Ghana for a period of five years.

63. MoH and the other beneficiary organisations insist their staff are bonded so that they return to their mother organisations. The duration of
the bond is between one year and a maximum of five years. Those who
flout the bond are to pay for the cost of the studies and, in addition, pay five
per centum penalty on the said amount.

64. Bonding is not effective. This is because the bond forms are not
signed and submitted, its terms and conditions are not stringent. Seven
interviewees out of 46 beneficiaries and desk officers interviewed said they
were not aware of the bond. According to the Registrar of Scholarships at
the Scholarships Secretariat, it is the responsibility of the Secretariat to
ensure that beneficiaries on completion of their courses return to Ghana.
The beneficiaries sign bonds, which are guaranteed by only one parent.
This makes the bond unrealistic because one parent is not likely to be able
to pay the amount involved (e.g. average of US $15,000), when the bond is
flouted. The Registrar said he is not aware anybody has ever paid the bond.

65. Ineffective bonding has contributed to beneficiaries’ refusal to
return home after their studies contrary to the provisions of their bond.
Beneficiaries go back or join other organisations without serving the bond
thus, defeating the purpose for which they were sent abroad; that is, to
return to work at their original workplaces. Leaving for other organisations
throws the plans and projections of the parent establishments into disarray.

3.6 Weak incentives for beneficiaries

66. One objective of the awards is to send our citizens abroad to pursue
courses that are not available in Ghana. They are to come back to help their
organisations or institutions and hence the country to develop. However, the
following conditions have thwarted this objective:

- Former beneficiaries cannot find employment;
it takes a long time to get the benefits they are entitled to, e.g. accommodation and upgrading or enhanced positions;

there is no job satisfaction because the resources and equipment to enable them use the knowledge acquired are not available; and

remuneration in the government sector is very low.

67. Eventually, the new graduates go abroad and beneficiaries who are already in employment leave for international organisations, NGOs and other local organisations that use their expertise and give them better conditions of service than pertain in the public service.
CHAPTER FOUR
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

4.0 Introduction

68. The overall aim of the awards is to alleviate qualitative and quantitative shortages of skilled manpower. Participants go overseas to acquire knowledge and technology in a wide range of fields. Upon return to Ghana, they are expected to put to use the knowledge and technology they have acquired. However, the audit revealed that the awards are not being used effectively because:

4.1 Awards elapse

69. Some awarding institutions do not advertise the scholarships. In addition, staff of MDAs are notified late. As a result,

❖ few staff get to know of the existence of the awards;
❖ staff cannot apply;
❖ staff do not know the criteria for the awards; and
❖ staff are not able to process their documents in time and therefore lose the awards.

70. In a memo of 16 January 2006, addressed to the Hon. Minister of MoFEP, the Deputy Director/Administration explained that as a result of distance and use of obsolete technology, it is common for some course announcements to be received late. Sometimes the authorisation by the Ministry to invite nominations tend to be delayed as a result of the approval procedure.
4.2 Beneficiaries do not return
71. The study revealed that a number of beneficiaries do not return to the country, thus, defeating the purpose of the awards. Results of our interview at Scholarships Secretariat revealed that 500 beneficiaries have remained in the USA after completing their courses in 2002 and 2003. Figures presented to Prof. S.Y. Mensah for analysis shows that 120 beneficiaries out of 166 did not return after their courses.

4.3 Inadequate and delayed funding
72. Funds given to beneficiaries by the Government of Ghana are inadequate and unduly delayed. These conditions have resulted in the following problems for beneficiaries:
   ✷ they are unable to meet their expenditure from the amounts and have to resort to doing part time work to survive;
   ✷ They cannot pay their rent, others work to enable them pay school fees whilst others fail to take their examinations because of unpaid school fees; and
   ✷ Shipping allowance which should be paid two months before their return to the country is paid between four months to three years after the arrival of the student in the country.

4.4 Ineffective monitoring of beneficiaries
73. Our Missions and Embassies abroad do not monitor the beneficiaries in the respective countries and so they do not know about the problems the beneficiaries face. Non-monitoring results in the following:
beneficiaries do not devote their time to following the course of instruction for which the scholarship is awarded;

- they engage in occupations or activities which are considered detrimental to their progress in their prescribed course of study;

- beneficiaries change their courses without the prior approval of the scholarship awarding authorities;

- beneficiaries do not take their examinations; and

- beneficiaries fail their examinations.

74. Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP do not adequately monitor the arrival of beneficiaries back to the country. Beneficiaries are to present reports to the awarding institutions between one to two weeks after their arrival to serve as evidence of their arrival. However, some awardees do not comply with this requirement. Consequently, the two institutions do not know their whereabouts, and thus, the activities of the majority of the beneficiaries.

4.5 Ineffective bonding

75. The awarding institutions and MDAs insist that beneficiaries are bonded so that they return to work for their mother organisations and for the government. On the contrary, we found that some beneficiaries do not sign the bond. According to the Registrar of Scholarships Secretariat, the bond is not stringent and has never been enforced. As a result, beneficiaries have refused to return home after their studies. Others have left their places of employment for better paid jobs without serving the bond.
4.6 Weak incentives for beneficiaries

76. Beneficiaries return abroad and those who stay in Ghana leave their organisations for international organisations and NGOs who use their expertise and pay them better than the public service. This is a consequence of the inadequate incentives that is militating against the retention of the beneficiaries in the government sector. The exodus is attributed to the following, among others:

❖ few employment opportunities in Ghana for the beneficiaries;
❖ low remuneration in the government sector;
❖ the resources and equipment to enable beneficiaries use the knowledge acquired are not available;
❖ benefits and entitlements are unduly delayed for returnee beneficiaries; and
❖ placing them in their rightful positions is unduly delayed.
CHAPTER FIVE
RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1  Making maximum use of awards

77. Notices of awards to staff arrive very late and since they cannot be processed in time to meet the deadline for submission, the scholarships elapse. To enable the country make use of all the awards available to it, we recommend the following:

✧ MoFEP and MoH should advertise all awards in the major local newspapers, as done by Scholarships Secretariat;

✧ Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH should ensure that notification of awards to tertiary institutions, MDAs and other beneficiary organisations are sent early;

✧ Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH must ensure that notifications are circulated to staff of organisations as widely as possible and time limit is set for the submission of application forms; and

✧ Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH should introduce the use of the Internet for the speedy processing of awards.

5.2  Ensuring that beneficiaries return home

78. In the previous chapter we concluded that beneficiaries of awards do not return to Ghana. According to a senior official of the Scholarships Secretariat, in the Eastern Countries foreign beneficiaries are closely
monitored and phased out gradually to ensure that they return to their home countries after completing their courses.

79. We recommend that Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP, MoH and Ministry of Foreign Affairs liaise with the countries that offer the scholarships to adopt a similar strategy as pertains in Eastern Europe to ensure that the beneficiaries return home after their courses.

80. Ghana's Missions abroad should not serve only as a conduit for the transfer of funds to beneficiaries of scholarships but also be made to closely monitor the activities of the beneficiaries to ensure that they return to Ghana on completion of their courses.

5.3 Adequate funding

81. The audit shows that funding of the beneficiaries' is inadequate. This is because the computations of beneficiaries' allowances are based on the outdated per diem chart of 1983. Furthermore, these allowances are unduly delayed. These two conditions have contributed to hardships for the beneficiaries. To reduce the hardships suffered by beneficiaries, we recommend that:

- Chief of Staff, Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP should impress upon the government to review upwards the rates used to compute allowances for beneficiaries;

- and

- Scholarships Secretariat, MoFEP and MoH should ensure that the allowances are sent to the beneficiaries on time, may be two weeks after the commencement of courses.
82. In response Scholarships Secretariat indicated that funds are no more unduly delayed since GETFUND has taken over the entire foreign component for tertiary training. In addition, GoG increased allowances for all foreign tertiary beneficiaries by 15% across the board in 2004.

5.4 Improved monitoring of beneficiaries

83. In the previous chapter we concluded that our Missions do not monitor the activities of beneficiaries abroad. On their return to the country, beneficiaries do not report to the awarding authorities, which do not know their whereabouts. To facilitate effective monitoring of beneficiaries, we recommend that:

- Chief of Staff, Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP should liaise with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to develop robust strategies to monitor the activities of the beneficiaries abroad, for instance, by assigning consular officers in our Embassies to monitor beneficiaries; and

- Scholarships Secretariat and MoFEP should send a list of all beneficiaries to our Embassies concerned to enable them proactively monitor the activities of beneficiaries.

84. Scholarships Secretariat agreed with us and stated that steps are being taken by the Secretariat. The respective missions in countries where GoG sponsored beneficiaries are studying, will receive list of beneficiaries to improve monitoring of the activities of beneficiaries.

Report of the Auditor-General on Management of Foreign Scholarships
5.5 **Effective bonding**

85. The audit shows that although bonding is one of the requirements for the awards, procedures for its implementation are ineffective. Many beneficiaries do not sign the bonds and bonding is never enforced. Consequently, defaulters do not pay the bond fees or penalty. According to Scholarships Secretariat, it costs the government an average of US$15,000 to train a Ghanaian student abroad. The result of the surveys discussed in the Findings chapter (Para. 47-49) concluded that 139 beneficiaries did not return. The nation, thus, lost €18.9 billion (US$2,085,000) spent on those beneficiaries. We recommend that:

- at least two easily recognisable (notable) citizens should sign the bond form and provide an immovable property to guarantee the bond;
- the awarding authorities and MDAs should not hesitate to use the security agencies of the country to enforce the bond when it is flouted; and
- awarding authorities should arrange with foreign institutions where beneficiaries are studying so that upon completion of their courses the universities will send the certificates to the awarding authorities. These will then be released to beneficiaries only after they have worked for the number of years stipulated in the bond.

5.6 **Improved incentives for beneficiaries**

86. In the previous chapter, we concluded that beneficiaries return abroad and those already in employment leave for local establishments,
international organisations and NGOs because of poor remuneration and other working conditions. We recommend that:

- MDAs and other organisations who benefit from GoG sponsorship should put in place effective plans to ensure the prompt placement of beneficiaries when they return to the country;

- MDAs and other public sector organisations should be well equipped by government to enable beneficiaries use the knowledge acquired for the benefit of the country; and

- Organisations should carry out a needs assessment to ensure that skills acquired are utilised by the particular MDA or the public sector in general.
The institutions visited were:

i. Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
ii. Scholarships Secretariat
iii. Human Resource Unit (Ghana Health Service)
iv. Ministry of Health
v. Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development
vi. Ministry of Agriculture (Accra, Kumasi, Tamale)
vii. Ministry of Education (Accra, Kumasi, Tamale)
viii. Ministry of Foreign Affairs
ix. University of Ghana
x. Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology
xi. University of Development Studies
xii. Accra Polytechnic
xiii. Kumasi Polytechnic
xiv. Tamale Polytechnic
xv. Tamale Municipal Assembly
xvi. Regional Health Directorate (Tamale)
xvii. Soil Research Institute
xviii. Crops Research Institute
xix. Savannah Agriculture Research Institute
xx. Komfo Anokye Teaching Hospital
xxi. Korle-Bu Teaching Hospital
xxii. GIMPA
xxiii. Tema General Hospital
xxiv. Tema Polyclinic
xxv. Tema Municipal Assembly
xxvi. JICA Office (Accra)
APPENDIX "B"

Scholarships Secretariat

Other requirements are:

- Curriculum Vitae which indicate the class and date of first degrees and other qualifications, and
- Detailed information about nominees’ programmes, areas of research, the relevance of their specialisation to the institution and the country.

1. Some donor countries like Russia give only partial scholarships. Their awards cover the following:
   a. Monthly allowance;
   b. Clothing allowance;
   c. Medical expenses;
   d. Any other allowances that is normally given to foreign students.

2. The Government of Ghana is responsible for the following (as of September 2004):
   a. Monthly additional maintenance allowance of $207;
   b. Book allowance of $300 every year;
   c. Air passage to and from place of study;
   d. Appropriate shipment allowance for the shipment of personal effects on completion of the course; and
   e. Health insurance of $200 every year.
3. The Scholarship Review Committee made up of representatives from the Universities/CSIR/Standard Board/Ministry of Food and Agriculture vets the application letter and the other documents.

4. After vetting the nomination, the documents are sent to the Castle for final approval by Chief of Staff.

**Bonding**

5. Students sign a bond to rejoin or to enter service in the civil establishment or armed forces of Ghana, if called upon to do so, for a period of five years. In default of the bond, they will be required to refund to the Ghana Government the sum expended on them plus interest at the rate of 5%. Award winners are expected to return to Ghana not later than six weeks after the expiry of the award on completion of the course.

**Reporting**

6. Beneficiaries of the awards are to present a report to Scholarships Secretariat in their arrival to the country after completing the course.

**GETFUND**

7. The award covers the following (as of November 2003):
   - Payment of recognised Tuition and Examination fees;
Monthly maintenance allowance at the current rate of £600;
- An economy air ticket to the place of study to commence studies, and from the place of study back to Ghana at the end of the award;
- Warm clothing allowance of $275 on arrival;
- Book allowance of £350;
- Thesis allowance of £400;
- Winding up allowance of £900; and
- Appropriate shipment allowance paid to beneficiaries' shippers for freighting their personal effects of not more than three shipping tons of 3.4 cu. M or 120 cu. ft at the end of the award.

8. It is the responsibility of the beneficiaries to keep Embassies and Missions informed about their progress at the end of every term by submitting an attestation of a satisfactory progress report from the Dean of Faculty or the Supervisor. The scholarship could be terminated in the event of misconduct or unsatisfactory progress in their studies or failure to pass any prescribed examination or if they change their course of studies without the prior approval of the Registrar of Scholarships. Beneficiaries are admonished to complete their studies within the stipulated time since no extension of the award would be tolerated.
9. Scholarship Secretariat assists all successful applicants to process their visas, although the individual has to follow-up the visa processing himself. Candidates are also required to undergo a medical examination at the cost of ₦155,000, borne by the applicant.

**Bonding**

10. Students enter into a bond to return home immediately on completion of the course and to place their services at the disposal of the Ghana Civil Service or their institution for not less than 5 years. In default of the bond, they will be required to refund to the Ghana Government the sum expended on them plus interest at the rate of 5%. Award winners are expected to return to Ghana not later than six weeks after the expiry of the award on completion of the course.

**Reporting**

11. Beneficiaries of the awards are to present a report to Scholarship Secretariat on their arrival to the country after completing the course.

**Japanese International Cooperation Agency**

**Funding**

1. Training and medical costs are borne by JICA. The allowances that JICA provides for participants are classified as follows:
   a. International Round Trip Air Fare;
   b. Living Allowance (expenses for room and board);
   c. Preparation Allowance;
d. Book Allowance;

   e. Material Mailing Allowance;

   f. Study Trip Allowance;

   g. Commuting Allowance (for regular expenses between lodging and training facility).

**Accommodation**

2. In principle, the participants stay at one of the ten JICA International Training Centres. In these centres, there are rooms for participants, dining facilities, a library, medical clinic, typing room and other facilities. The food is prepared in consideration of their customs.

**Bonding**

3. Beneficiaries sign a bond with their employers. The terms are the same as spelt out in paragraph 29.

**Reporting**

4. Beneficiaries are to report to the JICA office within a week after their return. They present an action plan of what they want to do with the knowledge acquired. Between six months and one year, JICA follows up to assess the plan and its impact.
Eligibility

1. Apart from a few requirements peculiar to specific courses, to be considered for pursuit of any of the courses, generally, applicants must:
   - Be a national of one of the 57 developing countries listed;
   - The applicant must have met all the requirements set by the Dutch university or institute;
   - Be nominated by her/his employer, who pledges to continue paying the candidates salary and to hold a job open for the candidate while he or she is in Netherlands;
   - Provide statements explaining the motivation of both the applicant and the employer;
   - Not be employed by a large industrial, commercial and/or multinational firm;
   - Declare that they will return to their home country immediately after the period of study and research in the Netherlands has ended;
   - Be available for the entire period of the course and be physically and mentally able to take part in the entire course;
   - Offer evidence of proficiency in speaking and writing the language of instruction (English in most cases).
Procedure for awards

2. The notification and the brochures are received early September. MoFEP sends copies of the brochure to ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs) and other tertiary institutions like the universities and the polytechnics. Candidates send nomination letters from their employers and admission letters to MoFEP. They are then given fellowship forms, which can also be downloaded from the Internet. The forms are completed and sent to MoFEP with the following attached:

- Original of admission letter;
- Copy of transcript and academic certification;
- Recommendation letter from employer;
- Two academic referees;
- Relevant pages of passport;
- One passport-size picture;
- Copy of birth certificate; and
- Copy of completed legalisation forms (MA and PHD) programmes.

3. There are deadlines for the processing of forms for each programme and documents received after the deadline are not accepted. MoFEP is given the list of successful candidates and the employers of the beneficiaries are informed. The beneficiary will then contact the embassy for pre-departure formalities e.g. applying for visa, medical examination etc.
Bonding

4. The beneficiary enters into a bond with his employer that is the same as stated in paragraph 29.

Reporting

5. After successfully completing the course the beneficiary is to present a report to MoFEP on his return to Ghana.

Funding

6. Funding is provided by the donor countries and partially by GoG as top-ups.

MINISTRY OF HEALTH (Fellowship Management)

Procedure for awards

1. This process is to nominate people and award fellowships six months to a year before studies are actually undertaken. The steps are as follows:

i. RDHS/Chief Administration/Divisional Director prepares priority lists every year (subject area & nominees) by April;

ii. Dir. HRDD compiles Regional and Divisional priority names & courses by June;

iii. Dir. HRDD & Dir. EAC compile lists of MoH available/anticipated Fellowships by June;

Report of the Auditor-General on Management of Foreign Scholarships
iv. Dir. PPME & Dir. HRDD produce list of priority training needs by April;

v. Interview panel is constituted and scores candidates according to available places by June;

vi. Fellowships Committee meets to determine/recommend awards between August and September; and

vii. Dir. HRDD administers the awards July of the following year (award letters, award regulations, bond, Fellowships monitoring database - computerised).

Selection Criteria

2. The main selection criteria are:
   - Except for conferences/seminars/some short course beneficiaries should not be above 50 years;
   - Benefits from previous study awards;
   - Performance after previous award;
   - Performance Appraisal Records of past 3 years;
   - Priority expertise/interest needed by MoH;
   - Probability of absconding; and
   - Previous disciplinary actions & severity
Bonding

3. The conditions for bonding are the same as in paragraph 29 of this report.

Reporting

4. Beneficiaries are to present dissertations (reports) to HRDD when they return.
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

MoH  Ministry of Health
MoFEP  Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MoE  Ministry of Education
FAC  Fellowships Award Committee
JICA  Japanese International Cooperation Agency
RDHS  Regional Director of Health Services
HRDD  Human Resource Developing Division
PPME  Policy Planning Monitoring and Evaluation
LIST OF DOCUMENTS

- Award letters to beneficiaries.
- List of Government of Ghana sponsored students abroad (Scholarships Secretariat).
- List of staff on study leave (KNUST).
- Criteria of selection into Health Training Programme (MoH).
- Guidelines for selection (CSIR).
- Training in Japan (JICA).
- All Inclusive Allowances for Persons Attending Conferences/Seminars Abroad (Per Diem).
- Brochure on Netherlands Fellowships Programme.
- Brief history and functions of Scholarships Secretariat.
- Bond forms.
- Organogram of Scholarships Secretariat.
- Rules Governing the Award of Scholarships Tenable Overseas under the Ghana Government Scholarships Scheme.
Mission Statement

The Ghana Audit Service exists

To promote

- good governance in the areas of transparency, accountability and probity in the public financial management system of Ghana

By auditing

- to recognized international auditing standards the management of public resources

And

- reporting to Parliament